Evaluating Country Economic Performance: Stabilization I

Dr. Edilberto Segura
Partner & Chief Economist, SigmaBleyzer
Chairman, Advisory Board, The Bleyzer Foundation
September 2014
I. Country Economic Analysis

• The well-being of a country & the performance of its capital markets (stocks and bonds) is affected by the strength of its economy.

• Therefore, a successful investor in any country must be able to analyze systematically the economic conditions of the countries.

• A sound economy is one that has both macroeconomic stability and sustainable economic growth.

  – **Macroeconomic Stability** is defined by stable prices with low inflation (**internal stability**), and a stable foreign exchange rate (**external stability**).

  – **Sustainable Economic Growth** is defined by a high rate of GDP growth that can be maintained over a long time.

• Solid macroeconomic stability and sustainable GDP growth are the two key factors affecting the medium and long-term performance of the stock exchange and bonds in an EM.
### Internal Stability: Inflation Rates (IMF)

**Countries with inflation of over 10% pa in 2012:** Belarus (70%), Syria (34%), Sudan (32%), Iran (27%), Argentina (27%), Venezuela (21%), Tanzania (15%), Uganda (15%), Mongolia ($12%)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Advanced Economies</td>
<td>1.7</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>1.9</td>
<td>0.7</td>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>1.4</td>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>1.4</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>1.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United States</td>
<td>1.9</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>2.9</td>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>0.9</td>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>1.6</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>2.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Euro Area</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>1.9</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>1.0</td>
<td>0.8</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>1.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Japan</td>
<td>-0.9</td>
<td>-1.3</td>
<td>-1.1</td>
<td>-0.9</td>
<td>-1.3</td>
<td>-0.5</td>
<td>-2.2</td>
<td>-1.9</td>
<td>-0.9</td>
<td>-0.7</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>1.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other Advanced Economies¹</td>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>0.8</td>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>1.9</td>
<td>1.6</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>2.2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Consumer Prices</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Advanced Economies</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>0.1</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>2.7</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>1.7</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>2.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United States</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>2.9</td>
<td>3.8</td>
<td>-0.3</td>
<td>1.6</td>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>1.7</td>
<td>2.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Euro Area²</td>
<td>1.9</td>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>0.3</td>
<td>1.6</td>
<td>2.7</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>1.7</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>1.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Japan</td>
<td>-0.1</td>
<td>-0.3</td>
<td>0.2</td>
<td>0.1</td>
<td>1.4</td>
<td>-1.3</td>
<td>-0.7</td>
<td>-0.3</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>0.1</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>2.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other Advanced Economies¹</td>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>3.8</td>
<td>1.4</td>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>2.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Emerging Market and Developing Economies</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Emerging Market and Developing Economies</td>
<td>13.1</td>
<td>5.9</td>
<td>5.6</td>
<td>6.5</td>
<td>9.2</td>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>6.0</td>
<td>7.2</td>
<td>5.9</td>
<td>5.9</td>
<td>5.6</td>
<td>4.8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Regional Groups</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Central and Eastern Europe</td>
<td>31.1</td>
<td>5.9</td>
<td>5.9</td>
<td>6.0</td>
<td>8.1</td>
<td>4.7</td>
<td>5.3</td>
<td>5.3</td>
<td>5.8</td>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>3.6</td>
<td>3.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commonwealth of Independent States³</td>
<td>39.0</td>
<td>12.1</td>
<td>9.5</td>
<td>9.7</td>
<td>15.6</td>
<td>11.2</td>
<td>7.2</td>
<td>10.1</td>
<td>6.5</td>
<td>6.8</td>
<td>6.5</td>
<td>6.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Developing Asia</td>
<td>5.0</td>
<td>3.6</td>
<td>4.0</td>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>7.3</td>
<td>2.6</td>
<td>5.6</td>
<td>6.4</td>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>5.0</td>
<td>5.0</td>
<td>3.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Latin America and the Caribbean</td>
<td>13.0</td>
<td>6.3</td>
<td>5.3</td>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>7.9</td>
<td>5.9</td>
<td>6.0</td>
<td>6.0</td>
<td>6.0</td>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>5.7</td>
<td>5.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Middle East, North Africa, Afghanistan, and Pakistan</td>
<td>7.1</td>
<td>7.1</td>
<td>8.2</td>
<td>10.3</td>
<td>12.4</td>
<td>7.3</td>
<td>6.9</td>
<td>9.7</td>
<td>10.7</td>
<td>9.4</td>
<td>9.0</td>
<td>7.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Middle East and North Africa</td>
<td>7.1</td>
<td>6.9</td>
<td>8.2</td>
<td>10.6</td>
<td>12.5</td>
<td>6.2</td>
<td>6.5</td>
<td>9.2</td>
<td>10.7</td>
<td>9.6</td>
<td>9.0</td>
<td>7.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sub-Saharan Africa</td>
<td>16.5</td>
<td>8.8</td>
<td>7.1</td>
<td>6.4</td>
<td>12.9</td>
<td>9.4</td>
<td>7.4</td>
<td>9.3</td>
<td>9.1</td>
<td>7.2</td>
<td>6.3</td>
<td>5.6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Real GDP Growth Rates (2012 Est)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>% gr</th>
<th>Country</th>
<th>% gr</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Macau</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>Saudi Arabia</td>
<td>6.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Panama</td>
<td>8.5</td>
<td>Georgia</td>
<td>6.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ghana</td>
<td>8.2</td>
<td>Peru</td>
<td>6.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cote d'Ivoire</td>
<td>8.1</td>
<td>Venezuela</td>
<td>5.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>China</td>
<td>7.8</td>
<td>Kazakhstan</td>
<td>5.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rwanda</td>
<td>7.7</td>
<td>India</td>
<td>5.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mozambique</td>
<td>7.5</td>
<td>Chile</td>
<td>5.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uzbekistan</td>
<td>7.4</td>
<td>Bolivia</td>
<td>5.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Congo</td>
<td>7.1</td>
<td>Latvia</td>
<td>4.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nigeria</td>
<td>7.1</td>
<td>Malaysia</td>
<td>4.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethiopia</td>
<td>7.0</td>
<td>Belarus</td>
<td>4.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sri Lanka</td>
<td>6.8</td>
<td>Colombia</td>
<td>4.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zambia</td>
<td>6.5</td>
<td>Uganda</td>
<td>4.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tanzania</td>
<td>6.5</td>
<td>Burundi</td>
<td>4.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qatar</td>
<td>6.3</td>
<td>Armenia</td>
<td>3.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kuwait</td>
<td>6.3</td>
<td>Azerbaijan</td>
<td>3.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indonesia</td>
<td>6.0</td>
<td>Mexico</td>
<td>3.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Russia</td>
<td>3.6</td>
<td>Norway</td>
<td>3.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moldova</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>Turkey</td>
<td>3.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Turkey</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>Israel</td>
<td>2.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Argentina</td>
<td>2.6</td>
<td>Korea, S.</td>
<td>2.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Slovakia</td>
<td>2.6</td>
<td>Poland</td>
<td>2.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Japan</td>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>Japan</td>
<td>2.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Zealand</td>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>United States</td>
<td>2.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Canada</td>
<td>1.9</td>
<td>Brazil</td>
<td>1.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hong Kong</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>Sweden</td>
<td>1.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Belgium</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>Spain</td>
<td>-1.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EU</td>
<td>-0.2</td>
<td>Slovenia</td>
<td>-2.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Denmark</td>
<td>-0.4</td>
<td>Italy</td>
<td>-2.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Netherlands</td>
<td>-0.5</td>
<td>Cyprus</td>
<td>-2.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Czech Rep</td>
<td>-1.0</td>
<td>Portugal</td>
<td>-3.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hungary</td>
<td>-1.0</td>
<td>Greece</td>
<td>-6.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UK</td>
<td>0.2</td>
<td>Russia</td>
<td>3.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ireland</td>
<td>0.7</td>
<td>Norway</td>
<td>3.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Austria</td>
<td>0.6</td>
<td>Turkey</td>
<td>3.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ukraine</td>
<td>0.2</td>
<td>Israel</td>
<td>2.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UK</td>
<td>0.2</td>
<td>Korea, S.</td>
<td>2.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>France</td>
<td>0.1</td>
<td>Poland</td>
<td>2.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Belgium</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>Japan</td>
<td>2.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EU</td>
<td>-0.2</td>
<td>Greece</td>
<td>-6.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Denmark</td>
<td>-0.4</td>
<td>Czech Rep</td>
<td>-1.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ukraine</td>
<td>0.2</td>
<td>United States</td>
<td>2.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Italy</td>
<td>-2.3</td>
<td>Germany</td>
<td>0.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Greece</td>
<td>-6.0</td>
<td>United States</td>
<td>2.2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

When GDP declines for two quarters, the economy is in **recession**.

A **depression** involves a GDP decline of more than 10% lasting over 2 years.

With GDP growth of 7.2% pa, the country will double GDP in 10 years.
Policy Results in Emerging Markets and Developed Countries

GDP in trillions of U.S. dollars.
Economic Stabilization and Structural Reform

- Improve welfare (quality of life)
  - Higher income
  - Lower unemployment
  - Lower income inequality

- High rates of sustainable economic growth
- Investment in education, health and environment
- Protection of the poor

- Higher budget resources

- Foreign & domestic private investments
- Productivity growth

- Improved business environment for superior profits and reduced risks

Macroeconomic policies for stable prices and foreign exchange rates
  - Fiscal policies
  - Monetary policies

Liberalization policies for free and competitive markets
  - Remove barriers to entry
  - Remove barriers to exit
  - Remove barriers to growth

Institutional development for sound public governance
  - Public administration reform
  - Legal/judiciary reform
  - Minimize political risks

The Three Pillars of Sustainable Development
• Macroeconomic instability increases the risk of doing business: with unstable prices (high inflation) and unstable exchange rates, it is not possible to do financial plans and project profits.
• Investors will require significantly higher rates of returns (higher risk premiums) to compensate for the risks of instability in prices and foreign exchange.
• As a result of this high risk premium, few projects qualify for investments, reducing the overall level of investments/growth.
• **Macroeconomic stabilization programs are based on the Absorption and Monetary Approaches to the Balance of Payments, which has three elements:**

  **A. Absorption Approach to BOP.** The first element focuses on Income and Expenditures (in particular, the government’s fiscal budget policies) and on the relationship between internal stability and external stability: there is a close relation between the size of fiscal budget deficits, overspending by the private sector, and current account deficits.
B. The second element introduces the **monetary sector**. If **money supply** (which is controlled by the Central Bank) exceeds **money demand** (the amount of money that people want to hold), then people will attempt to get rid of this excess money by spending it in local goods (contributing to inflation) or importing foreign goods (leading to balance-of-payment deficits).

C. The third element introduces the **Financial/Banking Sector and the role of Net Domestic Credit**: The excess growth of Net Domestic Credit over growth in money demand will equal the deficit in the **balance of payments**.

- These three factors define the **Financial Programming Model** of the IMF, which seek to determine the fiscal and monetary policies (the size of the fiscal budget deficit, the growth in money supply and the level of domestic credit by the banking sector) that are **“consistent”** with the country’s objectives for (i) GDP growth, (ii) level of inflation, and (iii) level of international reserves.
A. Absorption Approach and the Relationship among Fiscal Budget, Current Account, and Savings-Investments Balances

Definitions:

\( Y \) = Gross Domestic Product (\( Yncome \))

\( Y_d \) = Gross Disposable Income (\( C + S \))

\( C \) = Consumption, private

\( I \) = Investment, private

\( G \) = Government Expenditures

\( X \) = Exports

\( J \) = Imports

\( S \) = Savings, private, corporate and households

\( T \) = Taxes

\( \text{TR}_f \) = Net Transfers Received from Abroad (\( foreign \))

\( Y_f \) = Net Factor Income from Abroad (\( Yncome foreign \))

\( R \) = International Reserves

\( K \) = Foreign Kapital

\( A \) = Absorption (Expenditures)

\( \text{CAB} \) = Current Account Balance
An economy’s Money Flow without the Government and External Sectors:

\[ Y = C + I - Sc; \quad Y = C + Sh \rightarrow C + I - Sc = C + Sh \rightarrow I = Sc + Sh \rightarrow I = S \]
An economy’s money flow, with government but without the external sector.

\[ Y = C + I + G = C + S + T \]

\[ (I - S) = (T - G) \]

(10 - 10) = (6 - 6)

G↑ by 2, then I↓ or S↑

(8 - 10) = (6 - 8)

=> Crowding out
An economy’s money flow, with government and external sector.
(1) On the expenditure side: \[ AD \Rightarrow Y = C + I + G + X - J \]

(2) On the Income (supply) side: \[ AS \Rightarrow Y = C + S + T - Y_f - TR_f \]

Since Aggregate Demand must equal Income, then (1)=(2); or

\[
C + I + G + X - J = C + S + T - Y_f - TR_f
\]

Then:

\[
\frac{X - J + Y_f + TR_f}{Current\ Account\ Balance\ (CAB)} = \frac{(S - I)}{Private\ Sector\ Balance\ (PSB)} + \frac{(T - G)}{Fiscal\ Budget\ Balance\ (FBB)}
\]

If PSB=0, Current Account Balance = Fiscal Budget Balance
A Fiscal Deficit will yield an equally-sized CA Deficit

If FBB=0, Current Account Balance = Private Sector Balance
A Private Sector Deficit will yield an equal CA Deficit

All Savings (private sector, Gvt and foreign savings) must equal Investments for equilibrium in the goods market (\( I = \sum S \))

IMF studies show that a fiscal budget improvement of 1% of GDP improves the CAB by \( \frac{1}{2} \) of 1%, due to lower imports from lower domestic demand and rise of exports due to a weaker currency.

(1) \[ Y = C + I + G + X - J \]

(2) \[ Y = C + S + T - Y_f - TR_f = Y_d + T - Y_f - TR_f \]

where \( Y_d = C + S \)

\[ Y_d + T - Y_f - TR_f = C + I + G + X - J \]

\[ Y_d - [(C + I) + (G - T)] = X - J + Y_f + TR_f = CAB \]

\((C + I) = \) Expenditures of Private Sector = Private Absorption
\((G - T) = \) Excessive Govt. Expenditures = Govt. Absorption

Current Account Balance = \( Y_d - [\text{Priv. Absrp} + \text{Govt Absrp}] \)
Current Account Balance = \( Y_d - \text{Absorption} \)

- The excess of absorption (expenditures) over disposable income will be reflected as a deficit in the current account of the B/P.
- To correct a B/P deficit, you need to reduce Exp. or increase \( Y_d \).
- A devaluation would improve the B/P if it leads to an increase in income (\( Y_d \)) that is greater that an increase in expenditures (Abs), including those expenditures generated by the higher income.
2. Expenditures (Absorption) and Foreign Debt

- If FDIs are constant, the Current Account Deficit can be financed by:
  1. a reduction in International Reserves \((- \Delta R\))
  2. an increase in Foreign Debt \((+ \Delta K\))

\[
\text{CAB} = X - J + Y_f + TR_f = - \Delta R + \Delta K
\]

since:
\[
\text{CAB} = Y_d - \text{Absorption}
\]

therefore:
\[
Y_d - \text{Absorption} = - \Delta R + \Delta K
\]

- If expenditures (Absorption) are too high compared to Disposable Income, then: International Reserves would be falling or Foreign Debt would be increasing.

- To maintain International Reserves and avoid excessive Foreign Debt, expenditures (Absorption) should be reduced, normally by cutting Government expenditures, increasing tax revenues (reducing the fiscal budget deficit) or reducing private expenditures.

- All these identities are useful relationships to identify the need for expenditure reducing policies, including fiscal budget policies.

- But they provide limited guidance to monetary policy decisions. For this purpose, we need to add a number of accounting and behavioral relationships relating to the Financial/Monetary Block.
B. Introducing Money Demand and Supply

In order to use the previous macroeconomic identities to define more specific fiscal and monetary Stabilization Policies, we need to introduce some key monetary and behavioral relationships concerning the Monetary Sector, including Money Demand and Money Supply.

Abbreviations:

\[ M^d = \text{Money Demand: the amount of money that people want to hold (Liquidity preference)}. \]

\[ M^s = \text{Money Supply: the amount of money issued by the monetary and banking sectors} \]

\[ P = \text{Prices} \]

\[ E = \text{Exchange Rate} \]

\[ i = \text{Interest rates} \]

\[ NDC_p = \text{Net Domestic Credit to Private Sector} \]

\[ NDC_g = \text{Net Domestic Credit to Government} \]

\[ OIN = \text{Other Investments, Net} \]
Balance Sheet of the Monetary Sector

A key monetary relationship is the balance-sheet of the Monetary Sector (Central Bank and Commercial banks): its Financial Assets (International Reserves, Net Domestic Credit and Net Other Investments) will equal its Financial Liabilities (Money Supply) plus Equity:

$$M^s + \text{Equity} = R + \text{NDCg} + \text{NDCp} + \text{NOI}$$

If Equity and ONI are fixed, then:

$$\Delta M^s = \Delta \text{NDC} + \Delta R$$

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Central Bank Balance Sheet</th>
<th>Commercial Banks Balance Sheet</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Int. Reserves</td>
<td>Req. Reserves in Central Bank</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Net Domestic Credit to Govt</td>
<td>Net Domestic Credit to Private Sector</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other Investments.</td>
<td>Other Investments.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monetary Base</td>
<td>Demand Deposits</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Currency in Circ</td>
<td>Time Deposits</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Req. Reserves</td>
<td>CDs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equity</td>
<td>Equity</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Consolidated Monetary Sector</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Int. Reserves</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Net Domestic Credit to Government</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Net Domestic Credit to Private Sector</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other Investments, Net</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The Demand for Money and the Supply of Money

- A first key concept is that in an economy, people have a demand function for real money - \( M^d \) (currency in circulation and bank deposits), or have a "liquidity preference", which depends on real economic variables, such as the level of real income, real interest rates, rates of inflation, etc.

- This demand for money is determined, not by the monetary policy of the authorities, but by the public.

- On the supply side, there is an amount of money which is partly determined by the monetary authorities (\( M^s \)), through their discount rates, open market operations (trading of government securities) & reserve requirements.

- It is a key notion that while money supply is influenced by monetary authorities, money demand is independent and determined by the people.

- This leads to a second concept: when money supply exceeds money demand, the monetary balances of people exceeds their liquidity preference. Then, people will try to bring them down by spending the excess money in the purchase of local goods (which raises their prices) or in imported goods (which will put pressures on the balance of payments).

- Therefore, the Central Bank can reduce inflation and improve the balance of payments just by putting the monetary brakes to reduce money supply.
Formulation of the Demand for Money

• People will demand money ($M^d$) to facilitate their purchasing of goods and services, which in turn will depend on their real income ($Y$).

• Therefore, money "demanded" for transactional purposes will be:

\[ M^d = f(Y) \]

• But this is not the whole story, since total money demand would also depend on how much money people will be willing to hold for asset/speculative purposes.

• This will be a function of the cost & risks of holding money – versus other financial assets -- which depends on the level of nominal interest rates ($i$), inflation ($P$), and the exchange rate ($E$).

• Furthermore, according to Fisher, nominal interest rates is: $r + P^e$

• The demand for money ($M^d$) will depend on the level of real income ($Y$), the level of real interest rates ($r$), the current and expected price levels ($P, P^e$), and the exchange rate ($E$):

\[ M^d = f(Y, r, P, P^e, E) \] and in equilibrium = $M^s$

• This relationship also implies that inflation ($P$) depends not only of today’s $M^s$ but also on ‘expectations” of future inflation (Cagan).19
Excess Money Supply and Inflation

• The Quantity Theory of Money provides and early analysis of how "excessive" money supply can lead to price increases or inflation.

• It was first described by Copernicus (1526), the Salamanca School (1550), and Jean Bodin (1560) -- the last two to explain high inflation in Spain in the 1500’s due to excessive silver from Mexico & Peru.

• John Locke (1692), David Hume (1748) and John Stuart Mills (1848) described precisely the relation between money supply and the value of money transactions.

• It was formulated as an equation by Irving Fisher (1911) and reformulated in its modern version by Milton Friedman (1956).

• The main points can be described as follows:
  – In the economy there are 100 monetary units (M), which are spent exclusively in the purchase of goods.
  – In this economy the quantity of goods sold (Q) is 100 goods per year.
  – Then, the price of each good sold (P) will be 1 monetary unit (P).
  – Later on, the government prints money and the amount of money goes to 200 monetary units, but there are still 100 goods sold.
– Then the price of each good will be 2 monetary units: a 100% inflation rate.

Therefore: \( M = P \times Q \)

– Since this assumed a transaction velocity of money of 1, generalizing to a velocity different to one (\( Vt \)) - which implies a changing Money Demand, we get the formulation of the Quantitative Theory of Money:

\[
M \times Vt = P \times Q
\]

– Since the amount sold (Q) is proportional to the amount produced (Y):

\[
M \times V = P \times Y \quad \text{where } V \text{ is now the income velocity of money.}
\]

– Considering changes: \((1+ \Delta M) \times (1+ \Delta V) = (1+ \Delta P) \times (1+ \Delta Y)\)

– or: \(\Delta P = f (\Delta M, \Delta V, - \Delta Y)\)

**if Money demand and Production are constant (\(\Delta V=0; \Delta Y=0\)); then** \(\Delta P = f (\Delta M)\)

• In this case, inflation will be generated only by increases in money supply.

• In the case that Y (real GDP) grows by 3%, money demand is constant (velocity is constant), and the amount of money in the economy grows by 20%, and then inflation will be 16.5%, (ie, 1.20/1.03).
Indeed, in most countries there have been close historical relationships between increases in money supply and inflation:

---

**U.K. - Broad money growth and inflation**

Percentage changes on a year earlier

- **Broad money**
- **ONS composite price index**

Sources: Bank of England, Capie and Webber (1995) and ONS.

(a) Based on M3 until 1963 and then M4.
But the relationship between money supply changes and inflation is not automatic: In the UK, a 1% decline in interest rates will increase money supply rapidly; but will produce a 0.2%-0.3% GDP increase in one year, and a 0.2%-0.4% increase in inflation after two years. These relationships are called the monetary transmission mechanism:

Transmission Mechanism for Monetary Policy aimed at Increasing Income (Y)
The effect of money supply increases on prices (inflation) and income (GDP) will also depend on whether the economy is (i) at full capacity, (ii) has spare capacity, or (iii) has supply rigidities:
C. Introducing Domestic Credit and the Financial Sector

The Original Polak Model for Monetary Programming

For the economic system to be in equilibrium:

Money Supply should not exceed money demand; otherwise, people will try to get rid of this excess money by spending it into non-tradables (raising inflation) or in tradables (leading to a CA deficit and lower Reserves).

IMF Performance Criteria: In order to maintain a pre-determined level of International Reserves (which is necessary for the credibility of fixed exchange rates), there should be a limit on the size of Net Domestic Credit
C1. Introducing Domestic Credit and the Financial Sector: The Original Polak Model on Financial Programming

- The original IMF Financial Programming (developed in 1957) was designed to resolve and prevent Balance of Payments crises.
- It postulates a causal relationship from changes in Domestic Credit to changes in International Reserves (i.e., imbalance in the B-0-P).
- Control over net domestic credit expansion is the key to stabilize the level of reserves and therefore the Balance of Payments.
- The objective is the level of Reserves, given an income growth.
- Reserves are key to credibility of fixed ERRs (Krugman [1979]).
- It assumed fixed exchange rate regimes - the regimes in the time.
- Described by Four Equations (1) to (4):
  - $\Delta M^s = \Delta M^d$ (1)
  - $\Delta M^s = \Delta NDC + \Delta R$ (2)
  - $\Delta M^d = f(\Delta Y) = v^{-1}\Delta Y$ $v > 0$ (3)
  - $\Delta R = X - J + \Delta K = X - \alpha Y + \Delta K$ since $J = \alpha Y$ (4)

- Also: If $\Delta M^s > \Delta M^d$ then: (1) $\Delta P \uparrow$, $\Delta J \uparrow$, $\Delta X \downarrow$ and $\Delta R \downarrow$ and also (2) people will consume excess money in tradables: $\Delta J \uparrow$ & $\Delta R \downarrow$
Focus of the Polak Model:
To determine the effects of changes of net domestic credit on reserves.
Using (1), (2), and (3), one gets:
\[ \Delta R = \Delta M^s - \Delta NDC = \Delta M^d - \Delta NDC \]
\[ \Delta R = v^{-1} \Delta Y - \Delta NDC \]
- Reserves will decline (B/P deficit) when increases in net domestic credit (\( \Delta NDC \)) exceeds increases in nominal money demanded (\( \Delta M^d \)), which in turn depends on the rate of income growth (\( \Delta Y \)).
- Reserves stable if growth of domestic credit \( \Rightarrow \) nominal output growth
- If \( Y \) grows, \( M^d \) will grow and \( NDC \) can grow somewhat with \( R \) stable. But if NDC grows over and above grow in \( M^d \), then \( R \) will fall.
Management of net domestic credit is crucial in obtaining BOP objective:
\[ \Delta NDC = v^{-1} \Delta Y_{target} - \Delta R_{target} \]
- Given a target level of income growth (\( \Delta Y \)), and a target level of reserves (\( \Delta R \)) one can estimate the required change in \( NDC \)
- This allows policy makers to estimate a credit ceiling, i.e. Net Domestic Credit growth is a performance criterion in IMF programs
- Transmission channels: Assuming that \( Y \uparrow \) \( J \uparrow \) CAB deteriorates \( R \downarrow \)
then, if: \( NDC \downarrow \) \( M^s \downarrow \) \( M^d \rangle M^s \) \( i \uparrow \) \( I \downarrow \) \( AD \downarrow \) \( J \downarrow \) CAB improves \( R \uparrow \);
also as: \( i \uparrow \) \( K \uparrow \) \( R \uparrow \) \( \therefore \) A reduction of NDC lead to improved B/P
C2. Extended Monetary Programming of the IMF

- In the 1970’s, the model introduced the effects of changes in Prices & Exchange Rates (given the abandonment of fixed exchange rates in 1973.)
- It also introduced the Government’s fiscal block:
  \[ \text{Govt Revenues (T)} - \text{Govt Expenditures (G)} = \text{Fiscal Balance} = NDCg + Kg \]

For the economic system to be in equilibrium:
- Money Supply should not exceed money demand; otherwise, inflation will be up, imports up, & reserves down
- The Fiscal Deficit cannot exceed the amount financed by NDCg and Kg.

IMF Performance Criteria: (i) Maximum Size of Fiscal Deficit; (ii) Ceilings on Public Sector Borrowings (iii) Minimum Level of International Reserves (adj. in exchange rates)
Maximum Domestic Credit to the Government
Taking the Balance Sheet of the Banking Sector:

\[ Ms + NW = R + NDC_p + NDC_g + OIN \]

\[ \Delta Ms = \Delta R + \Delta NDC_p + \Delta NDC_g \]

- \( \Delta Ms \) is defined from its identity to money demand, given interest rates and targets on inflation and income.
- \( \Delta R \) is a target and is defined by the outcome of the Balance of Payments.
- \( \Delta NDC_p \) is defined by the requirements for working Cap/income growth of the private sector.

• Therefore, \( \Delta NDC_g \) will be the residual amount.
• This residual amount, Net Domestic Credit to Govt., is all the lending from domestic sources that can be given to the Government if the country were to have equilibrium in the money markets (inflation at target level).
• The size of a “consistent” fiscal deficit will depend on the amount of financing available: the amount of \( \Delta NDC_g \) plus any additional foreign loans that the Government may obtain.

\[ T - G = NDC_g + Kg \]

This model is still widely used by the IMF. BUT: it ignores equilibrium in the non-financial private sector (good markets -- I and S)
C3. The Original World Bank’s RMSM (Revised Minimum Standard Model)

- Developed in the early 1970s (Chenery & Strout) with the objective of making explicit the link between medium-term growth and equilibrium in the goods markets
  - Economic Growth is the key target, along with the level of Reserves (to avoid BOP crisis).
  - It is forward looking focused on the savings-investment gap.
  - But it ignored the monetary and financial sectors.

- Assumptions & Growth Theory behind the RMSM:
  - Linear positive relation between investment and output growth rates (Harrod–Domar, endogenous growth models). Emphasis on capital accumulation and its effects on Income through an Incremental Capital-Output ratio (which can vary in the future).
  - Additional foreign flows go to investment (Chenery and Strout [1966] model)
Five relationships define the RMSM model:

- National income identity:
  \[ y = y_{-1} + \Delta y = C^p + I + G + (X - J) \]  \( (1) \)

- Private consumption:
  \[ C^p = (1 - s)(y - T) \quad 0 < s < 1: \text{marginal propensity to save} \]
  \[ T = \text{taxes} \]  \( (2) \)

- Investment:
  \[ I = \Delta y / \sigma \quad \sigma: \text{inverse of the incremental capital-output ratio} \]  \( (3) \)

- Imports:
  \[ J = \alpha y \quad 0 < \alpha < 1 \]  \( (4) \)

- Balance-of-payments identity:
  \[ X - J = \Delta R - \Delta K \]  \( (5) \)
The structure of RMSM:

Target variables: $\Delta y, \Delta R$ (Macroeconomic Objectives)

Exogenous variables: $X$

Policy instruments: $G, T, \Delta K$

Predetermined: $y^{-1}$

Parameters: $ICOR (\sigma^{-1})$, marginal propensity to save ($s$), and import elasticity ($\alpha$)

Endogenous variables: $I, C^p, J$

Target equations (derived by substitutions):

$$
\Delta y = \frac{(s + \alpha)y_{-1} + (1 - s)T - (X + G)}{\sigma^{-1} - (s + \alpha)} \quad (yy)
$$

$$
\Delta R = X - \alpha(y_{-1} + \Delta y) + \Delta K \quad (bb)
$$
These two Equations can be solved (i.e. a numerical $\Delta y$ and $\Delta R$ can be obtained) in a Simultaneous Mode or in a Recursive Mode:

- **Simultaneous mode**: The first equation will give $\Delta y$ (growth rate) for a given $y_{-1}$, $X$, and the policies $T$ and $G$. Then substituting this $\Delta y$ into the second equation, will give $\Delta R$ for a given $\Delta K$ (or vice versa).

- **Recursive or Programming mode**: Set targets for income growth and $\Delta R$ and given $y_{-1}$, $X$, $T$ and $G$, through recursive (iterative) solution, calculate $\Delta K = $ financing needs. Alternatively, can use same approach to get $G$ [if $Y = f(G, J)$, we can reverse it for $G = f^{-1}(Y_{\text{target}}, J)$].

**Criticisms of RMSM:**

- Difficult to identify the binding constraint a priori.
- Assumes that import constraint as essential for income growth and investments; however, the foreign trade gap can also be closed by exports increases, thereby providing foreign exchange necessary for investment.
- Neglects relative prices and induced substitution effects among production factors (and their possible impact on exports).
- Incomplete: a growth-oriented model with emphasis on a small number of real variables but no government side and no monetary side, hence no use of huge literature on this relation.
C4. Merged IMF-World Bank RMSM+X Model

For the economy to be in equilibrium:
1. Money supply should not exceed money demand. Otherwise the inflation rate will be higher than dP.
2. The Fiscal Deficit cannot exceed the amount financed by NDCg and Kg.
3. The Private Sector Deficit cannot exceed the amount financed by NDCp, Kp and dMs.
4. The Current Account Deficit cannot exceed amounts financed by K and dR.

These four relations imply that the national identities hold: \( AD = AS = Y = C+I+G+X-J = C+S+T-TR \);

The IMF Performance criteria include: (i) Maximum size of the fiscal deficit;
(ii) Ceiling on public sector borrowings;
(iii) Minimum international reserves of three months of imports.

\[
(X - J + TR) = (S - I) + (T - G) \\
CAB = PSB + FBB \\
(K_g + K_p - dR) = (dNDCp + K_p - dMs) + (dNDCg + Kg) \]

\[
dMs = dNDC + dR
\]
C4. The Merged IMF-World Bank Model: The RMSM-X Model

- Adds the World Bank’s RMSM to the IMF’s Monetary Programming model.
- It covers the four major blocks: Monetary, Govt., B/P, and private sector.
- As in the IMF Extended model, relative prices and the exchange rate affect imports and domestic absorption.

**Basic Model Equations:**

1. **Money supply and domestic credit**
   \[
   \Delta M^s = \Delta NDC^p + \Delta NDC^g + \Delta R, 
   \]
   with \( \Delta NDC^p = \theta \Delta Y \) (Credit proportion for working capital)
   and \( \Delta R = E \Delta R^* \)

2. **Money demand**
   \[
   \Delta M^d = \nu^{-1} \Delta Y 
   \]

3. **Flow equilibrium of the money market**
   \[
   \Delta M^s = \Delta M^d 
   \]

4. **Government budget financing constraint**
   \[
   G - T = \Delta NDC^g + \Delta K^g 
   \]
(5) Balance of payments

$$\Delta R = X - J + \Delta K$$

with: $$\Delta K = E \Delta K^*$$, and: $$X$$ is exogenous.

Nominal imports: 

$$J = J_{-1} + (Q_{J_{-1}} - \eta E_{-1})\Delta E + E_{-1}(\alpha \Delta y + \eta \Delta P_D)$$

With $$(Q)$$ as import volume, $$(\eta)$$ price elasticity of imports and $$(\alpha)$$ income elasticity of imports (see Note 1).

(6) Changes in investments, output and prices

$$I/P = \Delta y/\sigma$$ where $$I$$ is Nominal Investment & $$\sigma^{-1}$$ is the ICOR

$$Y = Py$$ where $$Y$$ & $$y$$ are Nominal & Real Income

$$\Delta Y = Py - P_{-1}y_{-1} = Py - P_{-1}(y - \Delta y) \approx \Delta Py_{-1} + P_{-1}\Delta y$$

and: $$\Delta P = \delta \Delta P_D + (1 - \delta)(\Delta E + \Delta P^*)$$ (weighting $$P$$ and $$P^*)$$

Where:

$$\delta$$ is the relative weight of domestic goods in the price index

$$(1 - \delta)$$ is the proportion of imports (devaluation pass-through effect).

$$\Delta P$$ is domestic inflation and depends on the weighted domestic prices ($$P_D$$) and foreign prices ($$P^*$$)

$$\Delta P^*$$ is foreign inflation which is thereafter assumed to be zero.
(7) **Private sector budget constraint:**

Starting from the national income identities:

\[
AD = Y = C^p + I + G + (X - J)
\]

\[
AS = Y = C^p + S + T - Y_f - TR_f
\]

Since \( AD = AS \):

\[
(I - S) + (G - T) = - (X - J + Y_f + TR_f) = CAB
\]

Since \( CAB = \Delta K - \Delta R \):

\[
(I - S) + (G - T) = \Delta K - \Delta R
\]

Since:

\[
\Delta K = \Delta K^p + \Delta K^g
\]

and:

\[
\Delta R = \Delta Ms - \Delta NDC
\]

\[
\Delta Ms = \Delta Md
\]

\[
\Delta NDC = \Delta NDC^g + \Delta NDC^p
\]

Then:

\[
(I - S) + (G - T) = \Delta K^p + \Delta K^g - \Delta Md + \Delta NDC^g + \Delta NDC^p
\]

Since \( (G - T) = \Delta K^g + \Delta NDC^g \) from equation (4)

Then:

\[
I - S = \Delta NDC^p + \Delta K^p - \Delta M^d = \Delta NDC^p + \Delta K^p - \Delta M^s
\]

Which defines the private sector budget constraint: The excess of private investments over private savings must be financed from net domestic credit to the private sector (\( \Delta NDC^p \)), foreign capital for the private sector (\( \Delta K^p \)), and/or by a reduction in money supply.
Model Consistency

Another way of looking at the above is to combine the Government and Private Sector budget constraints in equations (4) & (7) to give the overall budget constraint for the economy (or savings-investment balance). This balance relates total savings (public and private) and investments to domestic & foreign financing ($\Delta NDC_g$, $\Delta NDC_p$, $\Delta M^d$ and $\Delta K^p$).

In fact, with some transformations, we obtain the sum of equations (4) and (7) as the following:

$$(I - S) + (G - T) = \Delta NDC + \Delta K - \Delta M^d$$

Since $\Delta NDC = \Delta Ms - \Delta R$ and $\Delta M^d = \Delta Ms$, then:

$$(I - S) + (G - T) = \Delta K - \Delta R = CAB$$

As we saw earlier, this last equation implies that the Monetary and National Income identities do hold (that is, $\Delta M^d = \Delta Ms$ and that $AS = AD$; $I = \Sigma S$:

$$AD = AS = Y = C^p + G + I + (X - J) = C^p + S + T - Y_f - TR_f$$
Footnote 1: Imports under the RMSM-X

\[ J = E \ Q_J \]  (with \( P^* \_J = 1 \))

\( J \): imports in nominal terms; \( Q_J \): import volume; \( E \): nominal exchange rate

- Changes in import volume depend on the change in real income (\( \Delta y \)) and the relative price of domestic and foreign goods:

\[ \Delta Q_J = \alpha \Delta y + \eta[\Delta P_D - (\Delta E + \Delta P^*)] \]

\( \eta > 0 \): import elasticity to relative price changes.

- Nominal value of imports:

\[ \Delta J = Q_{J-1} \Delta E + E_{-1} \Delta Q_J \]

so that:

\[ J = J_{-1} + (Q_{J-1} - \eta E_{-1}) \Delta E + E_{-1}[\alpha \Delta y + \eta(\Delta P_D - \Delta P^*)] \]

- With \( Q_{J-1} \) relatively small, a devaluation in the nominal exchange rate (\( \Delta E > 0 \)) will lower the nominal value of imports, improve the trade balance and thus increase official reserves.

- The last term of the equation can be dropped if we assumed that foreign inflation is small.
**Structure of the Merged Model:**

**Target Variables:** \(\Delta y, \Delta P_D, \Delta R\)

**Endogenous Variables:** \(\Delta Y, \Delta NDC_p, \Delta M, \Delta P, \Delta J, T\)

**Exogenous Variables:** \(X, \Delta K = \Delta K^p + \Delta K^g\)

**Policy Instruments:** \(\Delta NDC_g, \Delta E, \text{ and } G\)

**Predetermined:** \(y_{-1}, P_{-1}\)

**Parameters:** money velocity \((v)\), devaluation pass-through \((\delta)\), coefficient of credit proportion for working capital \((\theta)\), price elasticity of imports \((\eta)\), income elasticity of imports \((\alpha)\), incremental capital-output ratio \((\sigma^{-1})\), marginal propensity to save \((s)\).

**Solution of the Merged Model:**

- **Objective** is to relate targets, exogenous variables, and policy instruments to find the equilibrium values for \(\Delta y, \Delta P_D\) and \(\Delta R\) (in which \(Md=Ms\) and \(I=\Sigma S\)).

- **Starting with** the private sector budget constraint (7) in the Basic Model,
  \[ S - I = \Delta M^d - \Delta NDC^p - \Delta K^p \]
  But since \(S = Y - C^p - T\):
  \[ (Y - C^p - T) - I = \Delta M^d - \Delta NDC^p - \Delta K^p \]
  Since \(C^p = (1 - s)(Y - T)\) where \(s\) is the marginal propensity to save.
  Then:
  \[ I = s(Y_{-1} + \Delta Y - T) + \Delta NDC^p + \Delta K^p - \Delta M^d \]
  but since \(\Delta M^d = v^{-1}\Delta Y\)
  Then:
  \[ I = s(Y_{-1} + \Delta Y - T) + \Delta NDC^p + \Delta K^p - v^{-1}\Delta Y \]

- **Re-arranging** and using credit to private sector, \(\Delta NDC^p = \theta\Delta Y\), and assuming \(\tau = s + \theta - v^{-1} \) is positive (or \(v(s + \theta) > 1\)), we obtain the target equations of the Merged Model by substitutions in the Basic Model equations.
Target Equations of the RMSM-X Model

\[ \Delta P_D = \frac{-\kappa + (\sigma^{-1} - \tau)\Delta y}{\delta \tau y_{-1}} - (1 - \delta)\delta^{-1}\Delta E \]  

(1) \hspace{1cm} (yy)

\[ \Delta R + (\tau-s)(y_{-1}\delta \Delta P_D + \Delta y) = -(\tau-s)y_{-1}(1 - \delta) \Delta E - \Delta NDCg \]  

(2) \hspace{1cm} (mm)

\[ \Delta R = X - J_{-1} - (Q_{J,-1} - \eta E_{-1}) \Delta E - E_{-1}(\alpha \Delta y + \eta \Delta P_D) + \Delta K \]  

(3) \hspace{1cm} (bb)

- Equation (1) relates \( \Delta P_D \) and \( \Delta y \) based on equilibrium in the goods market (equation (7) of the Basic Model with I=\( \Sigma S \)) (the \( yy \) curve in the chart).
- Equation (2) relates \( \Delta R \) and \( \Delta y \) based on equilibrium in money markets (equation (3) of the Basic Model with Md=Ms) (the \( mm \) curve in the chart).
- Equation (3) also relates \( \Delta R \) and \( \Delta y \) but based on equilibrium in the balance of payments (equation (5) of the Basic Model) (the \( bb \) curve in the chart).
- These equations can be solved in a simultaneous or in a recursive basis.
- From these equations, one can see that a change in the policy instruments (\( G, \Delta NDCg \) and \( \Delta E \)) changes the equilibrium solution for \( \Delta y, \Delta P_D \) and \( \Delta R \).
• The above chart shows the simultaneous solution for the RMSM-X at equilibrium points E-A (giving $\Delta y^*$, $\Delta P_D^*$ and $\Delta R^*$)
• If the decision makers want to change the solution from points E-A to points E1- A1, this can be achieve through a combination of changes in the exogenous policy variables $G$, $\Delta NDCg$ and $\Delta E$.
• But to achieve final equilibrium, all these policy variables need to be adjusted.
Principles of Recursive (Programming) Solution

- Income growth ($\Delta y$), domestic price level ($\Delta P_D$), and reserves ($\Delta R$) are targets.
- Policy Instruments are the government budget ($G$), the exchange rate ($\Delta E$), and net credit to the government ($\Delta NDC_g$).
- To increase output, lower inflation, and increase reserves $\Rightarrow$ reduce government spending, $G$, devalue exchange rate, $E$ or lower $NDC_g$.
- Other examples of analysis:
  - Increasing NDC (domestic credit) to achieve higher growth will just result in higher inflation: $\delta y/\delta NDC > 0$; but $\delta P_D/\delta NDC > 0$.
  - To get higher reserves, reduce income growth and/or domestic credit, and devalue: $\delta R/\delta y < 0$; $\delta R/\delta NDC < 0$;
  - To achieve higher reserves, lower Government spending: $\delta R/\delta G < 0$. 
General characteristics of the RMSM-X model:

- Consists of four economic sectors: the public sector, the private sector, the consolidated banking system, and the external sector.
- Each sector is subject to its own budget constraints.
- National accounts, derived via aggregation of the sectoral budget constraints, serve to close the RMSM-X model.
- Two types of financial assets (money and foreign assets) in a standard model. For middle-income countries, some models include bonds.
- The money demand function frequently follows Polak Model in assuming constant income velocity of money.
- Some models disaggregate the banking system structure: instead of $M^s = \text{NDC} + R$, $M^s$ is rather obtained as the product of the monetary base and a constant money multiplier.
- Imports consist of several categories with the demand for imports a function of the real exchange rate and either real GDP or gross domestic investment (for imports of equipment).
- Consumption is generally assumed to depend only on disposable income -- thereby excluding consumption-smoothing effects.
- Investments is based on a simple ICOR formula.
Steps to Carry out Financial Programming

(2) Identify exogenous factors: world economy/trading partners.
(3) Set preliminary targets for the objectives of the country in terms of (a) GDP growth, (b) inflation and (c) level of International Reserves and set a preliminary policy package for other variables.
(4) Formulate a monetary program: money demand, banking sector.
(5) Prepare a balance of payment forecast: exports, imports, capital.
(6) Prepare a fiscal budget forecast: Govt revenues, expenditures.
(7) Prepare the private sector block balance, calculating investment requirements, given estimates of ICOR and income growth rate.
(8) Ensure consistency of forecasts with accounting and behavioral identities, through a recursive (iterative) process until you reach a fully consistent program, including external financing from IFIs.
(9) Review the conditionality attached to required external financing (IMF, IBRD), and decide how to monitor the program: prior actions, performance criteria, structural benchmarks, reviews.
Policy Options if the RMSM-X Model shows a Fiscal Gap

- If the fiscal deficit is higher than the amount of financing available, the Government has only four alternative policy options:
  1. To reduce Government expenditures
  2. To increase Government revenues
  3. To change other conditions in the economy to yield a larger volume of financing to the Government, such as: reduce credit to the private sector, increase money demand (by increasing growth, reducing interest rates and allowing higher inflation).
  4. To print money, which will lead to inflation.

- The “quality” of the measures to be taken to achieve a reduction in the deficit and achieve equilibrium is fundamental for the economic, social and political sustainability of the program.
Measures to Improve the Fiscal Budget:

Goal: To achieve and sustain Price stability and Foreign Exchange stability, through the elimination of Fiscal Deficits.

• Improve Government Revenues:
  – Improve Tax Structure -- Introduce VAT, excise taxes
  – Increase the Tax Base -- Tax all sectors, inc. agriculture
  – Improve Tax Administration -- focus on large taxpayers
  – Eliminate Tax Exemptions -- Eliminate privileges/subsidies
  – Improve Cost Recovery of Public Services - Inc. Power tariffs

• Improve Management of Public Expenditures:
  – Reduce Current Expenditures of Government -- Reduce Government Size
  – Improve Treasury Operations -- introduce Information systems
  – Reform the Pension System -- introduce fully funded systems
  – Eliminate Subsidies to Public Enterprises

• Decentralize Public Services to local Governments
  – Transfer responsibilities and financing to local Govts.
EGYPT's RMSM-X MODEL

Market for goods and services: \[ GDP = CP + CG + IP + IG + X - M \]

Money Supply \[ M2 = DTG + DTO + DTP + CUP \]

\[ DTG = (1 + g_{DTG}) \cdot DTG_{-1} \]
\[ DTO = (1 + g_{DTO}) \cdot DTO_1 \]
\[ DTP = (1 + g_{DTP}) \cdot DTP \]
\[ CUP = (1 + g_{CUP}) \cdot CUP_1 \]

Money Demand: \[ M2 = p_{GDP} \cdot GDP / v \]

Bond market \[ ABP = a_{BG} \]

Domestic credit market \[ CR = CRG + CRP + CRO \]

Foreign credit market \[ AFT = AFGI + APGU + AFM + AFO + AF \]

Exchange Rate: \[ e = p_{GDP} - p_M + ADDe0 \]

Deflator for Consumer Exp: \[ p_{cp} = \frac{(p_{GDP} \cdot GDP + p_m \cdot M - p_X \cdot X - p^1_1)}{CP} \]

Private consumption: \[ CP = + gSIYb + j22(inCP_, - ao - a,InYD ) \]

Export market : \[ XV=00 + #3GDP + (32(p_Xm-pG6P) \]

Total imports: \[ M = MFO + MOC + MCA + MIN + MPE + MNF \]

\[ MFO = MFO, \cdot (CPICP, )F \cdot (q/q-1 )OF \]
\[ MOC = MOC- \cdot (CPICP-1) oc \cdot (qIq/q )'Oc \\ *Xtl.X.I)" \]
\[ MCA = MCA1 . (111,/)" \cdot (q/9q_t),CA \]
MIN = MIN * (GDPIGDP, )EGDP * (q/q- )VJN 
MPE = (1 +gMPE) MPE_, 
MNF = ( 1+gMNF) MNF-, 

Government Revenues: TD + TI + NTR + NTRpaut - Cg - PFg – iPYMTg 
- SUB – GASC = Ig + NKIg + AREXPG + dDTDg 
– KOG - DIVo - INVRECl - KTPg - dAFg - dCRg 
- AFdsocsec - dBpg 

Government Consumption: CG = (1 'gCG)' CG., 
Government Investments IG = v * (GDP * pGDP) /pl 
Commodity Price projections: pMFO = e ' pMFO 
   pMOC = e'pMOC 
   pMCA = e pMCA 
   pMIN = e pMIN 

Expenditures deflator: II = pMCA4Psc *pGDP( -sca 
Private Expend Deflator: pCP = (pGDP*GDP +pM.M -pX.X -p!1)/ CP 
Reserves: RES = caMC/12 
Foreign capital KFS = (I-6)KFS_. + KF, 
   FS = pl [(I-5) KF-1 + K_ 
   FS = Pl [(l -5)FS-X + F.] 
Profit Remitances: PRM = USLIBR * FS + ADDPRM 
Investments: ICOR = I-1 / ( y - y-1)
Aggregate Demand-Aggregate Supply (AD-AS) Models

- The Typical RMSM-X model has a very simple Aggregate Supply (ICOR; \( AS = Y = C + S + T - Yf - TR_f \)). It ignores the effects on the supply of goods of such factors as domestic prices, labor wages, employment levels, level of capacity utilization, and the effects of total factor productivity growth.

- AD-AS models with more elaborated Supply Functions have been used to permit setting a relationship between AS and Prices. They also include more elaborated effects of Prices on Money Demand and Aggregate Demand.

- Overall equilibrium occurs where \( AD = AS \), thereby establishing the equilibrium level of Income and Prices \((Y^*, P^*)\), and the wage rate, the level of employment, along with the values of all the other economics variables obtained from the RMSM-X model.

- But due to poor supply-side data in EMs, these AD-AS models are only occasionally used by the IFIs.
Note: The RMSM-X model seeks equilibrium in the money markets (Md=Ms), the goods market (I=ΣS, AD=AS), the BoP, and the Government accounts. It is a variant (and competitor) of the original IS-LM/Mundell-Fleming model (shown below) for open economies, but with \( \Delta Y-\Delta R \) and \( \Delta Y-\Delta P_D \) in the axis.

The equilibrium income level \( Y^* \) may not coincide with full employment income \( Y_f \). In this case, Keynes postulated that the government should increase \( I \) (i.e., \( G \)) until \( Y_f \) is reached. Hopefully, interest rate would not vary due to a liquidity trap. The IS-LM curves would just move to the right, at highest levels of Md, Ms, I and S.

The IS-LM/Mundell-Fleming Model
Use of the Monetary Programming Model to Derive Consistent Equilibrium Exchange Rates

1. From the Monetary Block (in local currency): \( \Delta R = \Delta M_s - \Delta N_D C \)

2. From the B/P Block (in $): \( \Delta R = (X - J) + Y_f + T R_f + \Delta F D I + N F B - C B B \)

3. From the Real Sector: \( GDP = C + I + G + E (X - J) \)

\[ \Delta M_s - \Delta N_D C = E \{(X - J) + Y_f + T R_f + \Delta F D I + N F B - C B B\} \quad (1) \]

\[ \frac{\Delta M_s - \Delta N_D C}{(X - J) + Y_f + T R_f + \Delta F D I + N F B - C B B} = E \quad (2) \]

To introduce equilibrium in the real sector, from equation (1):

\[ \Delta M_s - \Delta N_D C = E (X - J) + S e\{ Y_f + T R_f + \Delta F D I + N F B - C B B \} \]

Since: \( E (X - J) = GDP - C - I - G \), then:

\[ \Delta M_s - \Delta N_D C = (GDP - C - I - G) + E \{ Y_f + T R_f + \Delta F D I + N F B - C B B \} \]

And:

\[ E = \frac{\Delta M_s - \Delta N_D C - (GDP - C - I - G)}{Y_f + T R_f + \Delta F D I + N F B - C B B} \quad (3) \]
## Improvements in Macroeconomic Stability in EMs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>1999</th>
<th>2001</th>
<th>2003</th>
<th>2005</th>
<th>2009</th>
<th>2012</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>External Debt/GDP</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fiscal Deficit/GDP</td>
<td>-4.0</td>
<td>-3.3</td>
<td>-2.9</td>
<td>-1.1</td>
<td>-3.0</td>
<td>-2.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Current Account/GDP</td>
<td>-3.1</td>
<td>+0.6</td>
<td>+2.0</td>
<td>+3.4</td>
<td>+2.7</td>
<td>+1.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inflation Rate</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### EMs - Credit Quality

- 6 = BB+
- 5 = BB
- 4 = BB-
- 3 = B+
- 2 = B
- 1 = B-

![Credit Quality Chart](chart.png)
## Fiscal Budget Deficit as % of GDP (2012 Est)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rank</th>
<th>Country</th>
<th>(% of GDP)</th>
<th>Rank</th>
<th>Country</th>
<th>(% of GDP)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>214</td>
<td>Venezuela</td>
<td>-17.50</td>
<td>206</td>
<td>Egypt</td>
<td>-10.40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>204</td>
<td>Syria</td>
<td>-9.50</td>
<td>203</td>
<td>Japan</td>
<td>-9.10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>200</td>
<td>Ireland</td>
<td>-8.50</td>
<td>194</td>
<td>United Kingdom</td>
<td>-7.70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>193</td>
<td>United States</td>
<td><strong>-7.60</strong></td>
<td>192</td>
<td>Greece</td>
<td>-7.60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>189</td>
<td>Spain</td>
<td>-7.40</td>
<td>182</td>
<td>Pakistan</td>
<td>-6.40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>175</td>
<td>Portugal</td>
<td>-6.10</td>
<td>168</td>
<td>Ecuador</td>
<td>-5.70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>160</td>
<td>Netherlands</td>
<td>-5.10</td>
<td>148</td>
<td>France</td>
<td>-4.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>130</td>
<td>World</td>
<td>-3.80</td>
<td>126</td>
<td>Canada</td>
<td>-3.80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>125</td>
<td>Ukraine</td>
<td>-3.70</td>
<td>116</td>
<td>Argentina</td>
<td>-3.20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>113</td>
<td>Austria</td>
<td>-3.10</td>
<td>105</td>
<td>Italy</td>
<td>-2.90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>103</td>
<td>Mexico</td>
<td>-2.80</td>
<td>97</td>
<td>Turkey</td>
<td>-2.60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>96</td>
<td>Romania</td>
<td>-2.50</td>
<td>89</td>
<td>Kazakhstan</td>
<td>-2.40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>84</td>
<td>Poland</td>
<td>-2.10</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>China</td>
<td>-1.60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>68</td>
<td>Bulgaria</td>
<td>-1.40</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>Australia</td>
<td>-0.80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>52</td>
<td>Colombia</td>
<td>-0.50</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>Russia</td>
<td>0.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38</td>
<td>Germany</td>
<td>0.10</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>Switzerland</td>
<td>0.30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td>Korea, South</td>
<td>0.60</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>Peru</td>
<td>0.90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>Chile</td>
<td>1.40</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>Brazil</td>
<td>2.70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Saudi Arabia</td>
<td>11.90</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Norway</td>
<td>15.20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Country</td>
<td>Debt as % of GDP (2012 Est)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Japan</td>
<td>236.56</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Greece</td>
<td>170.73</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Italy</td>
<td>126.33</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Portugal</td>
<td>119.07</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ireland</td>
<td>117.74</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>United States</strong></td>
<td><strong>107.18</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Belgium</td>
<td>99.03</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Iceland</td>
<td>94.17</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spain</td>
<td>90.69</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>France</td>
<td>89.97</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United Kingdom</td>
<td>88.68</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Canada</td>
<td>87.52</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cyprus</td>
<td>87.26</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Germany</td>
<td>83.04</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Austria</td>
<td>74.34</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hungary</td>
<td>73.99</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Israel</td>
<td>73.29</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Netherlands</td>
<td>68.20</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>67.59</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brazil</td>
<td>64.08</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pakistan</td>
<td>62.37</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poland</td>
<td>55.103</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Slovenia</td>
<td>53.203</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Malaysia</td>
<td>53.05</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finland</td>
<td>52.58</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Venezuela</td>
<td>51.31</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Norway</td>
<td>49.61</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Switzerland</td>
<td>46.71</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Slovakia</td>
<td>46.35</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Argentina</td>
<td>45.22</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thailand</td>
<td>44.17</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Czech Republic</td>
<td>43.12</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mexico</td>
<td>43.08</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taiwan</td>
<td>41.73</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Philippines</td>
<td>41.49</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South Africa</td>
<td>41.24</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Zealand</td>
<td>38.62</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Belarus</td>
<td>38.33</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Turkey</td>
<td>37.70</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sweden</td>
<td>37.15</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ukraine</td>
<td>35.24</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bolivia</td>
<td>34.82</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Romania</td>
<td>34.63</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South Korea</td>
<td>33.46</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hong Kong</td>
<td>33.09</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Colombia</td>
<td>32.18</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Australia</td>
<td>27.07</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indonesia</td>
<td>23.90</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>China</td>
<td>22.16</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Luxembourg</td>
<td>21.71</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peru</td>
<td>19.59</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ecuador</td>
<td>18.77</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bulgaria</td>
<td>17.88</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kazakhstan</td>
<td>12.39</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chile</td>
<td>11.42</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Russia</td>
<td>11.03</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Saudi Arabia</td>
<td>5.49</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## EMs External Debt (Public and Private) to GDP, 2011-12

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>ED/GDP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Latvia</td>
<td>146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hungary</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bulgaria</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ukraine</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kazakhstan</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poland</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Panama</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Czech Rep</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Turkey</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chile</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Philippines</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Malaysia</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pakistan</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indonesia</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thailand</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ecuador</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dom Rep</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Russia</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South Africa</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peru</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Colombia</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mexico</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Venezuela</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brazil</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paraguay</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>China</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Country</td>
<td>CA balance (% of GDP)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>-----------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zimbabwe</td>
<td>-36.23%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Georgia</td>
<td>-11.77%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moldova</td>
<td>-11.52%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Armenia</td>
<td>-10.93%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Belarus</td>
<td>-10.47%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cyprus</td>
<td>-10.44%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Turkey</td>
<td>-9.96%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Greece</td>
<td>-9.81%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Serbia</td>
<td>-9.50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Portugal</td>
<td>-6.45%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Iceland</td>
<td>-6.23%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ukraine</td>
<td>-5.45%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Romania</td>
<td>-4.40%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poland</td>
<td>-4.32%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Zealand</td>
<td>-4.18%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spain</td>
<td>-3.53%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Italy</td>
<td>-3.26%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>United States</strong></td>
<td><strong>-3.09%</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Colombia</td>
<td>-3.05%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>